

AGENDA ITEM 12

APPENDIX 2

A9 DUALLING PROCESS

ROUTE AND JUNCTION OPTIONS APPRAISAL

Appendix 2 – Route and Junction Options Appraisal

Key issues common to all route options and junction variants

Access:

- The Core Path Crossing Point on the A9 linking Blair Atholl to the Tullach Hill Viewpoint in the northern section requires mitigation so it can remain open both during and post construction.

Ecology & Landscape:

- There are no alternatives given for the northern section of the route, which has the potential to have significant impacts on woodland, erosion of the Historic Landscape for Blair Castle, visual effects from large cuttings, and impact on the designed landscape.

Community & Private Assets:

- No loss of development land, community facilities, or community land.
- Demolition of one residential property at Garrybank, Blair Atholl.
- Partial loss of land for Network Rail and Shierglas Quarry. Quarry access will be stopped up during construction, access provisions to be developed as part of Stage 3.
- Stopping up of access for two residential properties during construction.
- Disruption during construction may impact on visitor experience, particularly in terms of accessing the Visitor Centre at Killiecrankie and Blair Atholl and will require careful management.

Road Widening Alignment Options				
Route Options	Southern Section	Central Section	Northern Section	Appraisal
Option 1	Online widening to north of road	Online widening to north of road	Online widening to south of road – same for all options	<p>Access: The overall route alignment creates the lowest impact on existing NMU interests.</p> <p>Landscape & Ecology: Overall this option requires greatest cut especially to the southern section. This would be highly visible and have the greater landscape and visual impact. The loss of woodland on this option is the largest because of the need to remove the riparian woods through the central section. This option also has the greater impact upon the battlefield site through the loss of natural landform over the area of conflict.</p> <p>Community & Private Assets: Intermediate overall impact on number of residential, commercial and industrial properties, affecting 5 properties with additional temporary disturbance to one property during construction. Intermediate (highest) impact on agricultural, forestry or sporting land with greatest land take and affecting the highest number of land interests (7).</p>
Option 2	Online widening to north of road	Online widening to south of road		<p>Access: The overall route alignment creates a lower impact on existing NMU interests.</p> <p>Landscape & Ecology: This section still requires significant excavation on the southern section, as described for route 1, but the change to the northbound side of the road for the central section means that the features nearest the river are preserved. This has benefits for landscape and ecology.</p> <p>Community & Private Assets: Lowest overall impact on number of residential, commercial and industrial properties (5). Intermediate (highest) impact on agricultural, forestry or sporting land with greatest land take and affecting the highest number of land interests (7).</p>

Road Widening Alignment Options				
Route Options	Southern Section	Central Section	Northern Section	Appraisal
Option 3	Online widening to south of road	Online widening to north of road	Online widening to south of road – same for all options	<p>Access: The overall route alignment creates a higher impact on existing NMU interests. The route alignment in the southern section will overlay and remove an existing path (Path 1) which runs parallel to the A9 at House of Urrard to the west of Killiecrankie. This path was created in response to specific local conditions affecting public access in the vicinity of Urrard House and provides access to the Killiecrankie Memorial and battlefield from Killiecrankie village. Mitigation will be required.</p> <p>Landscape & Ecology: Using the landform on the northbound side of the road means less excavation in the southern section. Here the land adjacent to the existing road is relatively flat in many parts and so there would be significantly less change to the landform and loss of woodland cover. There is the opportunity to open up a positive view up the strath from this area. The widening of the southbound side in the central section however has the same disadvantages as for route option 1.</p> <p>Community & Private Assets: Intermediate overall impact on number of residential, commercial and industrial properties, affecting 5 properties with additional temporary disturbance to one property during construction. Lowest overall impact on agricultural, forestry or sporting land with lowest land take and affecting the least number of land interests (6).</p>
Option 4	Online widening to south of road	Online widening to south of road		<p>Access: The overall route alignment creates a higher impact on existing NMU interests. The route alignment in the southern section will overlay and remove an existing path (Path 1) which runs parallel to the A9 at House of Urrard to the west of Killiecrankie. This path was created in response to specific local conditions affecting public access in the vicinity of Urrard House and provides access to the Killiecrankie Memorial and battlefield from Killiecrankie village. Mitigation will be required.</p> <p>Landscape & Ecology: This is widening all along the north bound side of the road and shares the advantages in all sections as discussed previously. It has the least landscape and visual impact, including on the battlefield site with the least impact on woodland cover.</p> <p>Community & Private Assets: Lowest overall impact on number of residential, commercial and industrial properties (5). Lowest overall impact on agricultural, forestry or sporting land with lowest land take and affecting the least number of land interests (6).</p>

Junction Options at Aldclune (<i>Killiecrankie – south of Blair Atholl</i>)				
Junction Variant	Northbound Traffic Exit/Enter	Southbound Traffic Exit/Enter	Underpass	Appraisal
Variant A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Exit – Yes Enter - No <p>Any traffic wishing to get on to the A9 and travel north could not use this junction, they would have to drive through Blair Atholl and utilise the House of Bruar Junction to the north</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Exit – No Enter – Yes <p>Any traffic coming from the north on the A9 wishing to access Blair Atholl/ Killiecrankie must exit the A9 at the House of Bruar Junction</p>	Existing road B8079 between Pitlochry/ Killiecrankie and Blair Atholl passes under the A9 at Aldclune, all Junction options utilise this existing road and underpass	<p>Access: This junction variant is less favoured as it is likely to result in increased traffic on the B8079 road which is also National Cycle Route 7.</p> <p>Landscape & Ecology: The small footprint of this junction variant means that there is less change in land cover. It also makes the visual impact as low as possible. There would be slightly less loss of woodland though this is marginal.</p> <p>Community & Private Assets: Lowest overall impact than Variant B on number of residential, commercial and industrial properties (5). Lowest overall impact on agricultural, forestry or sporting land with lowest land take.</p>
Variant B	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Exit – Yes Enter - Yes <p>Allows for all traffic movements</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Exit – Yes Enter – Yes <p>Allows for all traffic movements</p>	As per Junction variant A above	<p>Access: This junction variant will have a lower impact on NMUs as it is not likely to result in increased traffic on the B8079 road which is also National Cycle Route 7.</p> <p>Landscape & Ecology: This junction variant is less favoured to the other junction by virtue of its larger footprint.</p> <p>Community & Private Assets: Increased land-take from Atholl Estate. Land take from woodland would increase by approx. 0.3ha. Overall the potential impacts on Atholl Estate would be unchanged from Moderate/Substantial. Additional impacts on one residential property through partial loss of garden and parking area. Loss of land would be least when Variant B is combined with Route Option 4.</p>